

CONTENTS

EDINBURGH CAR CLUBS CONFERENCE: 19 MARCH 2009

PROCEEDINGS.....	2
1 INTRODUCTION (09.30 – 10.00).....	2
2 CAR CLUBS IN A GROWING MARKET: WHAT WE CAN LEARN FROM CONTINENTAL EUROPE (10.00 – 11.00)	5
3 DEVELOPING THE CAR CLUB MARKET (11.20 – 12.45).....	9
4 WORKSHOP 1 – CAR CLUBS & FUTURE TRANSPORT SYSTEMS.....	19
5 WORKSHOP 2 – BIKE SHARING AND CAR CLUB – WORKING TOGETHER?	20
6 WORKSHOP 3 – TAKING CONTROL OF THE GREY FLEET: CAR CLUBS AS POOL CARS	21
7 WORKSHOP 4 – WILL A CAR CLUB WORK IN MY LOCALITY?.....	24
8 QUESTION TIME (15.30 – 16.20).....	25

Prepared by

Richard Armitage Transport Consultancy Ltd.
 Oxford House, Smithy Fold Road, HYDE, SK14 5QY
 Tel: 0161 368 6603; Fax: 0161 367 9242
 Mobile: 07973 538 556
 e-mail: richard@ratransport.co.uk
 web: www.ratransport.co.uk



Edinburgh Car Clubs Conference: 19 March 2009

Proceedings

1 INTRODUCTION (09.30 – 10.00)

Chair: Prof Steve Stradling, Professor of Transport Psychology, Transport Research Institute, Napier University; Chair of Transform Scotland Trust.

1.1 We are here this morning to celebrate 10 years of the Edinburgh City Car Club. Well I hear you say, what's to celebrate? They are still cars.

1.2 The *Guardian* warns that whatever we do now, the global temperatures will still rise by 2-4°C and that no amount of adaptation or mitigation will stop that. But we are here today celebrating car clubs in the city streets of Edinburgh.

1.3 Car club cars are not fuelled by electric or any renewable resources. They are not hydrogen powered, because there is no infrastructure. They are not even run on recycled chip fat.

1.4 We know that technology is not going to save us. As the minister said last night at the Reception, what is needed is behavioural change. What we are going to learn today is how car clubs are part of this solution.

1.5 Now I am going to hand you over to Phil Wheeler of the City of Edinburgh Council.

Councillor Phil Wheeler, Convenor of Transport, Infrastructure and the Environment Committee, City of Edinburgh Council.

1.6 Good morning everybody. On behalf of the City of Edinburgh Council I would like to wish you all a very warm welcome to the City Chambers and also to our capital city for those of you from further afield.

1.7 I also offer a special thank you to Richard Armitage, Transform Scotland Trust, SEStran and all those who have helped to arrange or sponsor this conference today and the Reception last night. Thank you to all of you.

1.8 As Convenor of Transport, Infrastructure and the Environment Committee, I am well aware that the matter of air quality is a key factor in combating climate change. The emission of vast quantities of greenhouse gases into the atmosphere cannot be good for the world. Part of the Edinburgh Manifesto is to create a cleaner, greener and safer city.

1.9 One significant feature with the problem of air quality within our city is the canyons that prevent the dispersal of fumes. These key features of our built heritage are contributors to today's problems and will be a key feature in tackling the problems in the future.

1.10 As Transport Convenor, it is clear to see that very little activity happens without transport of some form and that transport emissions are a major cause of air quality problems. Over the years, the city has embarked on a number of schemes to reduce the reliance on personal vehicles for every

day travel. This can be achieved in various ways. For a start, Edinburgh is very proud of the services provided by Lothian Buses. A higher proportion of commuters use the bus than other UK city other than London.

- 1.11 The continued development of park and ride facilities on the city fringes will encourage people to switch to public transport and will remove several thousand cars from our streets. Our trams will provide a clean and integrated use of public transport.
- 1.12 The Council is involved in a number of other initiatives to improve the problem of air quality and congestion. There has been interest in creating a controlled parking zone. This scheme was approved by the Transport, Infrastructure and the Environment Committee last month. This scheme will categorise cars in accordance with the cleanliness of their engines and will encourage people to switch to cleaner cars.
- 1.13 The Council has also embarked on a scheme with both the bus and freight industries with a view to establishing voluntary air quality arrangements within these sectors. I am happy to report that these discussions lately have been very constructive and there will not be a need for more draconian action.
- 1.14 Then, there is the Edinburgh City Car Club. Just over 10 years ago, a private car club scheme was launched in Edinburgh, with financial assistance from the Department of Transport and the then Scottish Office. This original scheme was set up in the Marchmont area of the city, where the density of the Victorian terraces generated all manner of pressures for residents, not least from the low availability of kerb space for parking.
- 1.15 This was the first such scheme in the UK, based on the European models that were operating in Switzerland and Germany. I am pleased to say that some of these continental pioneers are here with us today, to whom I wish a very warm welcome.
- 1.16 Unlike some European examples, the Edinburgh Car Club has always relied on technology to manage its operation, resulting in minimum infrastructure on the streets. Indeed, the only evidence of the club's activities are its parking bays. But for the past 10 years, there has been steady improvement to the technology it has used including the booking system, which has improved access to the cars.
- 1.17 One car club card could give access to buses, trams and the car club community, as well as other modes of travel. I am sure this is not beyond the realms of possibility.
- 1.18 The original operator, Budget Car Rental, withdrew after a couple of years, to be replaced by Smart Moves. Adopting the grand name City Car Club, they continue to operate to this day.
- 1.19 The current popularity of the scheme must be attributed largely to the efficient management of the whole scheme, for which the City is most grateful.

- 1.20 A few facts and figures: as mentioned, the original scheme had just 8 cars in 4 locations. These days the Car Club has over 80 cars based in 59 locations across the city. This fleet has well over 2,300 members, including some 450 Council staff. During the working week, the City Council has a block booking for 9 cars to support this facility. These cars are available for other users at other times. The availability of City Car Club cars contributes considerably to the Council's Transport Strategy to encourage sustainable car use.
- 1.21 The Edinburgh Car Club is not only the oldest car club in the UK, it is also the biggest outside of London. It is a great example of a partnership between the Council and the private sector. The Council does not pay the club to provide the service, but instead works to help promote the whole concept of pay as you drive motoring.
- 1.22 This certainly helps to reduce the total number of cars needed by our citizens and therefore helps reduce congestion and harmful emissions from our streets, not to mention alleviating the parking pressure. It is reckoned that each car replaces five or six cars that would otherwise be privately owned.
- 1.23 Earlier this week I attended a Community Council public meeting on parking pressures in Edinburgh. You will be glad to know I took the opportunity to promote the City Car Club.
- 1.24 A key and commonly overlooked facet of the Car Club is its contribution to social inclusion. This is achieved by offering access to a car when needed for those who may not be able to aspire to car ownership as well as for those who wish to dispense their privately owned vehicle. In these days of recession, the idea of being able to access a car when needed without having to purchase or maintain it directly must be an attractive proposition.
- 1.25 The City Council continues to promote the creation of on-street parking bays in many parts of the city. In addition to those in the City Centre, there are bays in places such as Granton and Portobello, in Morningside in the south, Niddrie in the east, and Edinburgh Park in the west. It really has become a city-wide operation. Many newer locations have been part funded by developers as part of the planning process to ease parking pressures for new residential developments.
- 1.26 Over its 10 years of existence, the City Car Club in Edinburgh has become one of our key institutions and thanks and congratulations are in order for those who came up with the idea and for all those who have supported it to its present level of success. We hope the Car Club will go from strength to strength in future years.
- 1.27 On the programme for today, you have a busy and varied schedule ahead of you. I am sorry that my diary does not permit me to stay with you all day but I hope to hear some of the outcomes and deliberations later on.
- 1.28 Welcome to this conference once again and I thank you in advance for your varied contributions.

Chair: Prof Steve Stradling

1.29 Thank you very much to Councillor Wheeler and thank you to the Edinburgh City Council on behalf of the conference.

1.30 Now can I welcome our keynote speaker Diane McLafferty.

Diane McLafferty, Acting Director, Transport Directorate, Scottish Government.

1.31 *Please go to the website to download a copy of the speaker's presentation.*

2 CAR CLUBS IN A GROWING MARKET: WHAT WE CAN LEARN FROM CONTINENTAL EUROPE (10.00 – 11.00)**Chair: Prof Steve Stradling**

2.1 Thank you very much. We must congratulate you on your hard work in providing an integrated framework for transport to go forward; yet another example of the ingenuity of the Scots.

2.2 The scene has been set. Let us now reach back into history and call on our next two speakers. Two of the founders of our car clubs movement.

Michael Glotz-Richter, City of Bremen Council

2.3 *Please go to the website to download a copy of the speaker's presentation.*

2.4 Ladies and gentlemen, it is really a pleasure to be here at this conference in Edinburgh. Talking about this, we can see these changes really leading to practical results; things that are really beneficial for the citizens of Bremen as well as for the citizens of Edinburgh.

2.5 I would like to thank Richard Armitage for the invitation, which gives me the chance to address these things to you. I must also apologise for some confusing terminology. What in the UK is called a car club is referred to in Germany as car sharing. It might be that I use this term in my presentation, but I am talking about car clubs.

2.6 Before taking you virtually to Bremen, the city that I am working with, I would like to take you on a virtual journey and would like to open up your mind to think about the way in which we are dealing with vehicles.

2.7 Please imagine that this picture (picture of a shopping trolley on the screen) is your shopping utility vehicle and that everyone would like to own one of these. As with other vehicles, you have it and then there is the pressure of where to park it. But where? You could leave it in your bedroom? Or you could leave it in the corridor of your flat or in your living room? It is not very practical. It takes up lots of space and that is what we find in our cities. There is a lot of space in Europe that is more or less misused as parking.

2.8 So, what would happen if we could just use this vehicle without all the hassle of ownership? We could have simple access and use it when we need it but leave it when we don't need it. That is a short introduction to the principle of car clubs.

2.9 Just imagine if we were as rational with cars as we are in shopping trolleys; all the space we could reclaim in our cities.

- 2.10 Now I want to take you deeper to a place that indicates where you are in Scotland and where we are in Germany.
- 2.11 The City of Bremen has approximately 550,000 inhabitants and we have quite a good modal split of our citizens. The car has a share of 40 per cent; 60 per cent of all trips are made by local sustainable modes. We have pedestrianised the historic centre, where a tram now operates, which is something I appreciate Edinburgh will soon experience.
- 2.12 Bremen is similar to Edinburgh as a city with a very high life quality, which in turn is enhanced by the quality of public space.
- 2.13 Our street-space is given to pedestrians, street cafés and also to cyclists. These things are not only practical but also have high symbolic value. For example, we have a priority for public transport at traffic lights. Public transport is also given its own road lanes. We also have good inter-modal connections between the various modes, for instance the regional rail and local buses and between buses and trams. This also includes seamless ticketing and there are 35 operators in the region all working under one ticketing regime.
- 2.14 Despite all the talk of low carbon fuels the bicycle is still the ultimate zero carbon mode of transport. This is a very clear statement and it is very normal for bankers and the like to use a bike to get around. Bike racks are full and in fact there is a problem finding parking for bikes.
- 2.15 Despite being an island for sustainable transport, Bremen still has its problems, which were created in the 1960-70s. The city had tried to adapt itself to the car. This is a reoccurring problem across all European cities, which coincides with the problem of limited space. Every tree you want to plant, every creation of a new footpath will lead to a reduction in parking; parking is extremely politically sensitive as I am sure you can appreciate.
- 2.16 It is really a question of whether we can use the space for much better purposes. It is not just a question of transport planning but also the planning of the whole urban environment. Car sharing for us is one of the transport strategy tools. Car sharing is an alternative to car ownership in conjunction with good cycling facilities and good public transport use. For Bremen, every car club vehicle replaces 4-8 private cars. As car clubs grow, we are able to ease the parking situation and our 5,000 car club members have removed around 1,000 private cars from the roads. This has in turn created around £19 million of investment from the space this has untied.
- 2.17 Car sharing is a tool for more efficient urban development so we can have more space for housing, a better urban environment and more support of public transport services. Car clubs apply largely to inner-city areas but these are the areas that have most of the most problems.
- 2.18 In Bremen, there are a lot of parking pressures and we need removable bollards to ensure that only car club members use car club parking spaces.
- 2.19 Car club parking and bike bays belong together and these should be tied in with public transport. These modes have the same target group. Those people who go to work via public transport may need a car for just two, three,

or four trips a week. This is also the reason why public transport in Bremen is involved in car sharing promotion, which is maybe the next step for car sharing here in Edinburgh.

- 2.20 The benefits are that we have lower car mileage, more use of public transport, walking and cycling. Then we have the various achievements in downsizing of the cars used and the very modern and energy efficient fleet. These aspects all impact directly on the reduction of CO₂ emissions.
- 2.21 People can also get the appropriate car for the type of journey, for example they may require a big car for a shopping journey but need only a small car for visiting a friend.
- 2.22 Interestingly, to conclude, as the number of inhabitants in Bremen is increasing, the level of public transport ridership is increasing but the number of private vehicle ownership is decreasing.
- 2.23 There is still huge potential for growth of our car clubs. We could potentially have about 4 million car club members in the European Union (now 25 countries) and this could allow us regain the space of about 600,000 cars in our cities. This principle is not just for Bremen, this is something that could be practiced in the bigger cities of the world such as Shanghai, which with their limited space and high density of people could in no way go to a similar ratio of car ownership to our European cities. Bremen's car clubs are going to be a show piece in a world exhibition of public transport in Shanghai next year.
- 2.24 I think that we are still at the very beginning of unlocking the potential of car clubs for our cities and we can show that car sharing is an alternative to the masses of space being taken up by the private car.
- 2.25 Thank you very much for your attention and once again, it is a pleasure to be here.
- Chair: Prof Steve Stradling**
- 2.26 Thank you very much Michael. Next up we have Joachim Schwarz from Cambio Mobility Services.
- Joachim Schwarz**
- 2.27 *Please go to the website to download a copy of the speaker's presentation.*
- 2.28 Good morning, I'm very happy to be here.
- 2.29 I have been asked to contribute to the question of what could car clubs in the UK can learn from enterprises such as Cambio. This may be the wrong question because in the last 3 to 4 years, car clubs in the UK have grown very fast and we should maybe pose the question the other way around.
- 2.30 Let me first introduce a little bit about Cambio. Cambio started in 1990. It was very small and not capital driven. There was a merger in 2000 with Cologne to develop new technologies and raise the level of quality of car clubs.
- 2.31 We provide our services to companies who are not part of Cambio but who wish to use our software etc. These are all local companies of small size. All-in-all, we are working with about 40,000 car club members. The growth in

size of the club has been very instrumental in attracting more new customers.

- 2.32 In order for us to get rid of the car from the city, it is very important for us to attract those people who already have a car. We believe car sharing is a local business and we get most of our custom from local sources.
- 2.33 The question, 'will I have a car when I need one?' is the most asked question when people join our car club. If you really want to convince people to get rid of their car, they have to have total trust in the car club. Car clubs must provide cars when they are needed, be on time, be of good quality and be reliable in any situation.
- 2.34 By packing our bookings close together, we have reached a utilization rate of about 10 hours per day without frustrating the customer. Bringing high utilisation rate and a good quality customer service together is very important to make the business work.
- 2.35 The capital funding behind car clubs in the UK is very much stronger than that behind car clubs in Germany. Cambio also does not get the support of on-street public parking, as is the case in Edinburgh.
- 2.36 It is however important to get good secure parking in accessible locations. We are able to rent secure underground parking facilities, where we can also locate a key locker.
- 2.37 We have several cars at each car club location, which is different to Edinburgh where you have just one or two. This allows the possibility of making open-ended reservations.
- 2.38 Car club locations have to be close to workplaces. This is because employers will not pay for the time it takes for a member of staff to walk long distances to reach a car club car. It is consequently very rare that a member of staff will walk above 15 minutes to reach a car. We have also decided not to promote professional car sharing when the location has less than 5 cars. This means there are parts of towns where car clubs are not yet feasible. There is however increasing flexibility to open up car club locations as there are constantly new customers joining.
- 2.39 Car clubs in the UK work out to be expensive for short distances but are free or relatively inexpensive to join. Long trips are cheaper in UK as the pricing is by the hour and you do not pay for the petrol.
- 2.40 Pricing in Germany is done by the mile, which is cheaper for city driving but more expensive for longer journeys. Car clubs should be aimed for short trips with a high price level for longer journeys. The continental pricing system may also be more attractive to customers.
- 2.41 People on the continent use car clubs cars fairly frequently for the first couple of months but then their usage starts to decrease.
- 2.42 We have gone through a learning curve. There is a need to provide services for people with different requirements. We need to be flexible. Car clubs do not reach out enough for the different types of users.
- 2.43 Thank you for your time.

Questions and Comments

Note: Q = Question, A = Answer, C = Comment

- 2.44 **Q: Dave Holladay (Integrated Transport Specialist)** – Could a similar system to mobile phones, which are allowed to roam within different areas, exist with car clubs in paying an enhanced fee to use more networks?
- 2.45 **A: Joachim Schwarz** – In Germany, we already do this. We try to avoid competitive situations. As long as there is no competition, then it is very easy. Where there is competition, it is more difficult.
- 2.46 **A: Michael Glotz-Richter** – From a business perspective, you would need the different operators to have the same type of technological equipment.
- 2.47 **A: Joachim Schwarz** – There are devices that can overcome this. City Car Club cars in Edinburgh could potentially be opened by the systems used by Cambio.
- 2.48 **Q: Dave Holladay (Integrated Transport Specialist)** – Can you see public transport operators investing in car sharing?
- 2.49 **A: Joachim Schwarz** – There are public transport operators already helping to run car clubs in Germany, Belgium and France. Public transport comes into contact with a great many people. Figures already show that where there is a car club in operation, public transport ridership increases. When you have a car, you are more likely to use it for many journeys. It is therefore in the public transport operator's interest to promote car clubs. The combination of cars and public transport is a very productive combination.
- 2.50 **Q: Bernie Henning (OYBike)** – Do you have any data on what people use car club cars for?
- 2.51 **A: Joachim Schwarz** – The data is very old. We are not really interested in what people do with the cars. We are more interested in when people take the cars. Time is very important. On a weekend and in evening, you have leisure use and in the work day you have business use. You really have to balance the target groups so that you have continuous peaks throughout the day. You also have to ensure that you retain continued availability of the cars. What we are interested in is when people start their journey, when they return the car and how long the trip is.
- 2.52 We do know that 30 per cent of our users are children. We know this because we have asked our members. We have also asked how old the children are.

Chair: Prof Steve Stradling

- 2.53 Thank you very much for your contributions.

3 DEVELOPING THE CAR CLUB MARKET (11.20 – 12.45)

Dr Jillian Anable: The Centre of Transport Research, University of Aberdeen.

- 3.1 *Please go to the website to download a copy of the speaker's presentation.*

- 3.2 I am going to be looking into the psychology of traveller behaviour and behavioural solutions. I am also going to be looking at transport and carbon emissions in the broadest sense, in particular the trade off or synergises between technological solutions and behavioural solutions.
- 3.3 I am going to be talking from the macro, the transport managing context, and then focusing down on the individual level in car clubs and how I see car clubs fitting in with lifestyles.
- 3.4 One of my strongest messages from today's conference is that we need to start to talk about car ownership. It is one of the great taboos. I am not talking about stopping people having the right to car ownership. I am also not ignoring the fact that in some sections of society we actually need to increase access to car ownership. What I am going to be talking about very strongly is the vision of how people can access ownership in different ways and also about models of car ownership. I think we also need to break the link between car ownership and car use and I think car clubs can offer a model that hits two boxes; both delivering choice to people and signalling that the car does have a place in certain circumstances.
- 3.5 Car clubs can act as the glue to stick some of the soft or smarter measures together. They can enable peoples' lifestyles to change over the longer-term by maintaining access to a car whilst allowing them to change their lifestyle. Car clubs can also straddle a lot of the different policy objectives such as developing a niche market for technology, improving operational efficiency and giving people sustainable travel choices.
- 3.6 I am also going to talk about car ownership trends. The psychology of car ownership, from my point of view, is who owns a car, who doesn't own a car and who might join a car club.
- 3.7 Transport is the only sector in the economy where emissions consistently increase year-on-year. This is transforming the transport sector from one of the smallest contributors of carbon emissions to one of the largest.
- 3.8 There are effectively four ways in which we can save emissions from the transport sector. We can improve the technical efficiency of vehicles, which also includes the use of alternative fuels; we can improve the operational efficiency by improving occupancy rates and the way in which people drive their cars; we can ensure that someone uses the most efficient mode of transport for a particular journey; and we can manage the amount of travel in the system.
- 3.9 Transport policy in the UK, as with many other countries, has concentrated very much in the technological efficiency part of this quadrant. By far the majority of savings are due to come from voluntary or mandatory agreements with motor manufacturers. The rest of the savings are going to come from a mish-mash of policy such as sustainable freight regulations, investment in public transport, smarter choices and so on. There are a lot of reasons why many of the aspects of the carbon saving agenda will not come to fruition, particularly the case where technology is concerned. Even with all the policies in place, carbon emissions are not expected to reduce by 2020, their pattern is hoped to merely stabilise.

- 3.10 Why is technology not good enough? It is because of the timescales involved, it is because of the uncertainty of the technology and because as we improve the fuel efficiency of vehicles there is a rebound effect. For instance, as vehicles become cheaper to run, people will buy larger cars and will drive for longer. Can technology keep pace with the expected demand in the system? How much is that technology going to cost? Electric vehicles are not zero carbon and we know there are a lot of issues around creating bio fuels. There are also other externalities that we need to solve in the transport system such as congestion, social exclusion, parking and so on.
- 3.11 Let us continue now onto car ownership. Firstly, the average distance that is travelled by car within the UK has stabilised. At the same time, cars per adult are still increasing rapidly. This means that the average number of miles per vehicle is actually going down.
- 3.12 The reason why car ownership is actually going up is because the switch from one car households to two car households is increasing and the number of households with no cars is decreasing. The number of one car households has stabilised.
- 3.13 Within this, there are differences between the people who are taking up driving licences and car ownership. The general trend has seen an increase in women taking up driving and an increase in older age groups.
- 3.14 There has however been a fall in the number of younger age groups taking up licences and car ownership. This may be because higher numbers of younger people are taking on higher education and this may result in affordability issues. What we do not know is if that is going to manifest itself in later years in an increase in car ownership.
- 3.15 The single most important factor is the amount of car use in the system. When a person drives a car, their amount of public transport goes down by about 80 per cent. When someone uses a car club car, their use of public transport goes up.
- 3.16 There are essentially three reasons why car ownership fosters high car use. The first is the economics of car ownership. Car ownership has a high fixed cost and people want to get the most out of their car. For a car that costs between £10,000 and 13,000, the cost per mile goes down considerably over its lifetime. Up to 4 years, the cost of a car is about 77p per mile but this reduces by half over the span of a car's whole lifetime.
- 3.17 The average household car, used for commuting, travels approximately 11,000 miles per year but a similar car that does not commute travels about 8,000 miles per year. This says that if you can get people to not use their car for commuting, they would find a significant cost benefit in getting rid of their car because the cost benefit would go down to a figure where the car is very expensive per mile.
- 3.18 There is a lot of publicity about how economically efficient it is to be a member of a car club, particularly if you drive below a certain mileage threshold per year. However, there is also a lot of work that has established that people are not economically rational.

- 3.19 The findings of a study into car purchasing behaviour revealed that people actually have very little understanding of what fuel efficiency means. A lot of people think that it is how much it costs to fill their tank, which suggests the larger the tank the better. Some people think in terms of it costing more or less than their last vehicle. Very few people know the true fuel efficiency of their car. In England we talk about miles per gallon, on the continent it is kilometres per litre. This is something in the car club that we can really sell the service on. We do however have some big hurdles to get over.
- 3.20 Lynn Sloman writes about the time penalties of car ownership. The average Briton today devotes 1,200 hours to their car. Policy evaluation puts high time penalties onto public transport but what if they costed in the time penalties of actually owning a car?
- 3.21 When people own a car they become very reliant on it. They lock themselves into patterns of use. They can now decide to shop elsewhere, send their children to school elsewhere, work elsewhere and so on.
- 3.22 There is good news and bad news in terms of how reliant people say they are on their car. For different modes of travel, you have a range between 40 and 70 per cent of journeys where people say they could find an alternative to the car. This shows there is a lot of slack in the system. But there are some real sticking points around travel to work and supermarket shopping, which people believe they need their car for.
- 3.23 Looking at the psychology of travel behaviour and car ownership, there are a whole number of things that we need to get to grips with. There are issues with time and cost but there are also huge issues with status and identity in car ownership.
- 3.24 With respect to environmental behaviour, many people want to be part of a community or part of a movement. Car clubs are a perfect way of tapping into this through being part of a club or having membership.
- 3.25 There are also issues of power and wanting to be in control. These issues are often very difficult to measure but equally have a great effect on peoples' behaviour. The big thing about having a car is that this is their point of reference when considering the alternatives. Whether people have the choice to change is also a hugely important factor.
- 3.26 I helped to do some work which tried to group people in accordance with their attitudinal behaviour to see who was most likely to join a particular club.
- 3.27 Malcontented motorists are a group who are quite dissatisfied with their car use. They find driving quite stressful but they all think that the alternatives of public transport are quite awful in comparison. They seem like they want to change because they have dissatisfaction in their circumstances but there are big hurdles to get over to convince them that there are any alternatives to suit their lifestyle.
- 3.28 Complacent car addicts are quite indifferent. They are not particularly wedded to their car and do not really go through status identity emotions in terms of car ownership. They already exhibit a willingness to use alternative modes of transport. They have high car ownership but they do not tend to

use them as much. They are open to alternatives. They are motivated by cost savings but not the environment or the desire to use their car less. The alternative needs to be on their doorstep for them to use it.

- 3.29 The term 'die hard drivers' suggests that this is a group that is not likely to change but various studies have shown that the die hard drivers have quite a lot of potential to change. The reason is that they do have quite a strong emotional attachment to the car but they are also what we may call early adopters of technology, which could really have some potential when promoting the niche technology behind car clubs. It would seem however that they are certainly not willing to use public transport.
- 3.30 The aspiring environmentalists are the group with the highest potential for recruitment to car clubs. They already have a very pragmatic approach to car use. They are more likely to be single car-owning households (or want to be) and they are more likely to already use a whole range of modes and use the most appropriate mode for the appropriate journey already. They seem to be doing this for environmental reasons. They have already tried alternatives such as hiring family cars to go away on holidays and they are open to the idea of alternative access.
- 3.31 About 25 per cent of households do not own a car. Lower numbers of employees do not own a car and there is a strong correlation between high income and high car ownership. My understanding is that car club members in the UK are actually high-income employees and homeowners. This is saying that car club members are not the typical non car owner. This is a good thing because car clubs are not just being attracted to those people who want to own a car but also those who do not want to.
- 3.32 The Department for Transport did a detailed study into the reasons why people do not own a car and found the main reason to be that no one in the household can drive, the cost of driving and where it is not necessary because other transport is available
- 3.33 I found three types of non car owners in my study. The people most likely to join a car club were the car sceptics, who have already given up the use of their own vehicle and do not like car travel but hire cars for holidays so may see practical benefits of car club membership; the reluctant riders would prefer to have greater access to a car and use one when they have a chance (as passengers); car aspirers, who are a main target are people who want to own a car at the first available opportunity.
- 3.34 We need to do some careful thinking about how to attract people in and keep them hooked, not just let them use a car club as a stopgap until they can afford a car of their own. There are windows of opportunity where you would try and capture people. It is however very important to get people to think about car clubs before they decide to move house or job. We should allow people to see the consequences of their actions in terms of their travel.
- 3.35 At any one time, there are people making decisions on whether to give up their car or acquire one. This is called the churn. There are currently more people acquiring a car than there are who are giving one up. We are seeing unsustainable patterns of ownership and use. We need to turn this pattern

around. As we talked about segmentation, we understood that there are different groups of people who need different measures and different incentives to make this change.

- 3.36 A car club members survey found that people who joined a car club reduced their car mileages by over 50 per cent. They also make more trips on foot and bicycle than the average population. There was only a small effect on public transport usage, but this may have been attributed to the fact that many of the people surveyed used public transport before they joined the car club and that the survey was mainly done in London.
- 3.37 The tariff structure of car clubs encourages chaining, which is a very efficient way of using a car. There is also evidence that car ownership is suppressed as a result of joining a car club. The study showed that there was a figure of 11 to 12 cars removed from the road for every car club car.
- 3.38 What we really need to do when collecting the evidence in this area is not just look at the before and after statistics but to ask what would have happened had these people not joined the car club. Obviously it is impossible to collect that information but we need to try and think about these things because this is what is important to policy makers, convincing them that car clubs should be supported and invested in. It is also about the long-term lifestyle shifts that car clubs can instigate.
- 3.39 So why do I think that car clubs are the glue that sticks the smarter choice and behavioural solutions together? It is because of the longevity of the behavioural change. There is concern with voluntary behaviour change measures that people will fall back into their old habits but car clubs deal with car ownership, which is something that has a more permanent impact on peoples' lifestyles.
- 3.40 Car clubs also targets both the car dependant and the socially excluded areas of the population. I think it can become a niche market for alternative technology and this is also important to be able to be attractive to a number of different people. Car clubs can improve operational efficiency and provide greater choice and also suppress people into travelling less.
- 3.41 In order for car clubs to stick, from a user perspective, we need the system to be very flexible. I think we need people to be able to use a car club car in more than one location, not just their home town. We desperately need integration with other modes. What would fix all these together would be a national travel card that could be used across the modes that pays for fuel, pays for public transport and pays for parking etc. on one card. This is what needs to happen and it needs to happen soon. We can not afford for this to take a long time. We need to think about these things and we need to think about them now.
- 3.42 We need to raise awareness. Even in a policy context, a car club is a phrase that you would not necessarily be aware of. Car clubs need to be talked about. They should be incorporated into travel plans for business and to individual travel patterns and we have to link that to the new technology.

- 3.43 Car clubs save small but significant amounts of carbon, and it is significant because there are very few policies that save big amounts of carbon. We need lots of policies which together will add up to big savings.
- 3.44 Back to my original point that we need to break the taboo of talking about car ownership; car clubs are a definite way of doing that.
- 3.45 Thank you for your time.
- Chair: Prof Steve Stradling**
- 3.46 Thank you very much Jillian. A plethora of fascinating facts there and a number of important items that lead me onto the policy agenda.
- Marshall Poulton (Head of Transport – City of Edinburgh Council)**
- 3.47 *Please go to the website to download a copy of the speaker's presentation.*
- 3.48 Good afternoon everybody and welcome to a sunny Edinburgh.
- 3.49 It is interesting to hear what Jillian was saying. What I want to do is give you a whistle stop tour of the development of the city car club to see how far we have travelled in the past 10 years, where we are now and more importantly where we are going in the future to continue the success.
- 3.50 Edinburgh is the political and financial hub of Scotland. It is also on the historical map of the world. We are the drivers of transport innovation and we had the first scheme of this kind in the UK. It was based on models already established in Switzerland and Germany. This was in addition to the success of the public transport priority schemes.
- 3.51 The council has always had a commitment with its local transport strategy to ensure cars are used more efficiently and more effectively through measures such as parking management and promotion of the city car club.
- 3.52 In 1998-99 we had 4 sites with 8 cars. These were in the Marchmont area, chosen for its demographics. These were middle income young professionals in their early 30s. This was based on research done in European cities, which indicated that these were the type of population that were most likely to subscribe to the service.
- 3.53 The original car club was operated by Budget from 1999-2001. Smart Moves and City Car Club took over the operation in 2001. The Council supported the City Car Club at this time by booking 3 vehicles and that gave the car club time to establish itself and ensure that the vehicles would be used by the wider public, which was very important. It gave the Council an economically viable alternative to fleet vehicles. The Council also showed its commitment to the scheme by providing parking spaces for the Car Club and then painting the on-street car club bays free of charge.
- 3.54 By 2001 the number of locations for parking had expanded to 15. The availability of the City Car Club in Edinburgh's more traditional shopping areas encouraged more use, whilst also pleasing retailers and contributing to the Local Transport Strategy.
- 3.55 We identified early on that the European model for working and using vehicles was not as slick or as technology-based as it could be. When Smart

Moves, later renamed City Car Club, took over, the scheme moved to smartcard operation with online booking. You could also book from your phone for a small charge or even book from the car itself.

- 3.56 To keep the continuation of the success of the car club the council is looking for an active partnership ensuring the maximum potential for this scheme.
- 3.57 Membership grew from 2004-08 from 273 to 2,260. This is a 9-fold growth over a 4 year period. In the same timeframe there was more than a 10-fold increase in private members and the number of vehicles quadrupled. The statistics also show the Council's support with its high membership and block-booking. This was also largely attributed to the increased marketing by City Car Club.
- 3.58 To achieve the continuation of the service that Smart Moves was offering, we introduced internet booking as an alternative to telephone booking. This period had the highest growth in private members. The Council assisted by adding 9 vehicles to the service.
- 3.59 The Club now has 82 cars in 52 locations with over 2,300 members, 450 of which are Council staff. This is the result of really good partnership working.
- 3.60 The tram in Edinburgh will have 24km of tramline and 22 stops. The Council is looking to integrate cycling and car clubs with the tram, which it is hoped will increase productivity.

Chair: Prof Steve Stradling

Thank you very much for that. Next up is James Finlayson.

James Finlayson, CEO, City Car Club

- 3.61 *Please go to the website to download a copy of the speaker's presentation.*
- 3.62 Thank you very much. I have got to start off by saying that I am very new within the world of car clubs and have only been in the business for 3 years. I can only give you the most recent details of where we are in the city.
- 3.63 Before I start I wanted to say thank you to everyone who has organised this conference and I also want to thank everyone who has ever supported city car club, because without you, this would never have happened.
- 3.64 It has been a long journey to get to where we are but it is only recently - in the last couple of years - that we have seen the progress required to get the impressive statistics that we have seen today. We plan to continue this growth.
- 3.65 There are 2,500 members as of today. We have found the mix of business and private use to be an essential ingredient of the success because this balances the private use in the evenings and weekends with business use on weekdays. We had almost 100% increase in membership last year and we hope to continue that sort of growth.
- 3.66 We now have some university campuses using the car club too so there is potential for growth here.

- 3.67 Jillian Anable said that most people who use the car club are middle-aged. I would slightly disagree with that, depending on your definition of middle age. We find that there are many younger people who use the car club. What has opened up the university market is that we have lowered our minimum membership age to 19 years old, which is costing lots on insurance premiums but at the same time opens the door to attract people at an early age before they go out and buy their first car and get into the whole cycle of car ownership.
- 3.68 The Edinburgh Car Club had its first year of profitability last year. City Car Club is privately financed by shareholders who have put lots of money into the business, and who were losing lots of money; so it is great to see the Edinburgh Club reaching profitability. Hopefully, this will be the case for everywhere in the near future.
- 3.69 Partnerships have already been talked about but they are essential. If anyone is thinking about setting up a car club in a new city, partnerships and passion are the most important things behind success. You have to have that framework and relationship for the provision of parking bays and to act as an anchor to use and promote the car club.
- 3.70 The car club has grown primarily out of self-funding through developer contributions but there have been contributions from local taxpayers' money, which is a nice thing to emphasise. It is also nice to have a plan and we have always worked with the Council on a schedule for the next 12-18 months ahead.
- 3.71 There is also the basis of enforcement of the parking bays, which is essential too. If someone is illegally parked in one of our bays, it is very useful to have a strong partnership to sort out those issues.
- 3.72 Most importantly is that the car club has been widely accepted by the residents and businesses within the City of Edinburgh. We have full backing in terms of membership and now profitability.
- 3.73 The press have also been really helpful to us. In the early years when the car club was not moving as fast as it is now, there were some issues with the press but it has all raised awareness of car clubs.
- 3.74 The improvements in technology have also been very important. Originally we worked on a paper system, almost on a trust basis. The cars did not used to be very user-friendly and not very technology-driven. Now we use online technology, online reservations and online billing, which all works well with the user.
- 3.75 We are a private business but we have also had considerable private financial support.
- 3.76 With any new concept, it is a slow start and you go through a learning curve. A lesson we have learnt along the way is that things perhaps take longer than you expect.

- 3.77 We have learnt not to grow our fleet too quickly. We have had years where we have had a very rapidly growing fleet. You have to keep the right balance of revenue earned by the car to the number of cars in operation.
- 3.78 Location is a critical factor. You have to have the right location for car clubs to work. We plan to continue expanding along this vein.
- 3.79 Our plans for the future have to be careful of the current economic climate. Our growth so far has not been stunted at all. We are however seeing a 10-15 per cent drop in the number of journeys being taken and also that journey distances are 10-15 per cent shorter. We do have to be aware of the economy for our expansion plans.
- 3.80 We are working on increasing our membership and the ratio of members to hours of car use per day. We also want to increase the number of locations of car clubs across Edinburgh and the travel information. My plan is within 5 years to have a car within 5 or 10 minutes walk of virtually everyone across the city. I hope we will have 150 cars within 18 months.
- 3.81 We have had more input from the city and the public than any other city in Britain, which gives us great potential for future growth. We also looking to expand to Glasgow and we are currently in the early stages of this process.
- 3.82 We need political support. This is not just a local issue but a national one, which needs to build more promotion and awareness of cars clubs.
- 3.83 Partnerships with public transport are very important. We would like to be part of the smartcard system in Edinburgh.
- 3.84 Car clubs are not just a London thing. They are becoming big across the UK and it is great to have this event to publicise the fact that it was Edinburgh that was the first car club within the UK. I think we should celebrate this and capitalise on it in going forward.
- 3.85 Thank you very much.
- Chair: Prof Steve Stradling**
- 3.86 Thank you. We will round up our story this morning with Alister, who has been a member of City Car Club for some years now.
- Dr Alister Hamilton, member of Edinburgh City Car Club**
- 3.87 I am going to firstly tell you a little bit about my history of car club membership. My family have been members since 2000. We live in Morningside. At the time, the Car Club was not local to me so I had to be very committed and be prepared to travel to the car by bus.
- 3.88 I was never a car owner, although my wife was. My interest in City Car Club grew when my children were starting to get older and there was need for a car to go to sporting events and parties, particularly weekends.
- 3.89 When I joined initially, the car club was dire. I persevered and Council said that within 6 months there would be considerable improvements. There was also negative press. When Smart Moves came in, the difference in service was like night and day. The Car Club became much more user friendly and

the technology was much more sophisticated and reliable. The support now is brilliant in terms of the call centre etc.

3.90 The Edinburgh Evening News gave it a negative press. There was generally a low opinion among people but I wrote a piece in the newspaper about car clubs to support the idea.

3.91 As long as the Car Club is there, I plan to continue to use it. I am now trying to persuade my son, who is 16 years old, to use car club when he learns to drive.

Questions

Q: Antonia Roberts to James James Finlayson – How do you deal with children and child seats? Did you carry booster seats?

A: James Finlayson – Children and families are a problem. We are not massively child friendly as an operator. There are so many different types and sizes of child seat and if we had the wrong seat for a child, the company could be held liable. There is also a problem in fitting the seat. Child seats are too big to fit in the boot. We have decided to take the route that if an individual wants to bring a child seat, it is down to them to bring it with them.

C: Phil Noble (City of Edinburgh Council and member of City Car Club) – I have young children and we just use our own car seats.

C: Marshall Poulton – From the Council's perspective, we would agree with the liability issue so would back the car clubs' point.

Q: Gill Kelly (Queen Margaret University) – If people take a car on a day trip, the car is sitting there all day and is not being used but still being paid for. Is there any way of having a different tariff for this sort of thing?

A: Car clubs are designed to stop people from taking the car for a long period of time.

A: Alister Hamilton – Because I don't own a car, which would be a very large financial burden, I don't feel the cost or pressure as much with hiring out a car club car for longer periods. In fact, I hire the car for longer periods of time to remove the pressure created by time in returning the car.

4 WORKSHOP 1 – CAR CLUBS & FUTURE TRANSPORT SYSTEMS

Contributors

Derek Halden, Managing director, DHC Ltd.

Dr. Jillian Anable and Michael Glotz-Richter

Conclusions

4.1 Car clubs are part of the route to public transport use.

4.2 Car clubs at rail stations should become widespread, partially funded by the railways and making rail transport more integrated with other forms of transport.

4.3 Joint tariffs and ticketing are needed with all modes including car clubs.

- 4.4 Business models need to evolve to create something more sustainable.
- 4.5 Make car club links a requirement of tendered bus services.
- 4.6 Interchanges are critical with part bike, car club, rail, bus all on similar sites – with clear publicity so that users of other modes see the car clubs.
- 4.7 Publicity needs to use many more channels working in partnership with other transport operators.
- 4.8 Integrate into all new housing development.
- 4.9 Use bodies like UITP to persuade politicians.
- 4.10 Smartmedia make joint offers more achievable but the work is not introducing the technology but is setting up the deals.

5 WORKSHOP 2 – BIKE SHARING AND CAR CLUB – WORKING TOGETHER?

Contributors

Bernie Hanning, Managing Director, OyBike Systems Ltd.

Dave Holladay, Integrated Transport Specialist

- 5.1 *Please go to the website to download a copy of the speaker's presentation.*

Bikeshare

- 5.2 Car clubs and bike share both provide a street based rental service.
- 5.3 Bike share can deliver the same outcomes as car share but can target different markets. Bike share can offer more convenience with a door-to-door service. Bike share is also attractive to tourists and active travellers. There are however overlaps in the market.
- 5.4 Bike sharing can also be used for one-way journeys where car clubs are not.
- 5.5 As with a car club, user doesn't have to own, clean or repair the bike.
- 5.6 Both cars and bikes have parking problems, for example, around stations. Bike-share can provide a space efficient solution. Connections to main transport hubs are key to success.
- 5.7 Cycling is seen by many to be unfashionable but having everyone riding the same type of bike helps to overcome this barrier.
- 5.8 Bike share encourages people to try and take up cycling without having to buy their own bike.
- 5.9 Needs a minimum of three people using a bike per day to be viable.
- 5.10 Needs each bike station to be a minimum of 300m apart.
- 5.11 Bike share should use mobile phone technology. Mobile phones are predicted to be the smartcard of the future. They are able to perform an increasing range of services (e.g. route planning). Mobile phones can also break the language barrier.
- 5.12 There are opportunities for sponsorship panels on the back of bikes.

- 5.13 Bike stands can be designed to fit into the urban environment. They can also be fitted with solar panels etc. to charge the box's battery.
- 5.14 Cycle routing is a major obstacle. Users in unfamiliar areas don't know which routes to take compared to a taxi where you don't have this problem.
- 5.15 London has its red buses, New York has its yellow taxis. Bike share can similarly help a city create its identity.

Oybike

- 5.16 OyBikes are very distinctive and easily identifiable from their bright yellow colour. The bikes have one standard design. This makes them a deterrent for theft. The bikes are also designed to be vandal resistant, for example, they have almost puncture-proof tyres.
- 5.17 OyBikes are city bikes, which means they are adapted for the city environment. They have at least 3 gears and weigh 20 kilograms. The pedal mechanism is shaft driven, instead of using a chain, which makes them cleaner and less prone to wear.

How the system works

- 5.18 The latest rental system is designed for easy use. It uses a battery-operated control box, which can be attached or removed to existing cycle infrastructure, such as walls or bike stands, in less than 15 minutes. Being battery operated enables the system to be set up free of an electric supply. The speed of installation also means that the system can be quickly and easily set up or relocated should there be any problems. This also allows temporary use.
- 5.19 A typical bike stand has a 3-bike capacity. The control box contains a locking mechanism that is deactivated by a mobile phone call. This call is free of charge. The user can then choose which bike they want to use.
- 5.20 The box looks like and cash point to create a familiar feeling for the user. It has a colour screen and can also provide mapping and route advice.
- 5.21 The first half hour of use is free but and there is a maximum charge of £8 for a whole day.

6 WORKSHOP 3 – TAKING CONTROL OF THE GREY FLEET: CAR CLUBS AS POOL CARS

Contributors

Richard Armitage, Managing Director, Richard Armitage Transport Consultancy Ltd.

Chris Endacott, Director, Gfleet Services Ltd.

- 6.1 *Please go to the website to download a copy of the speaker's presentation.*
- 6.2 Glossary: the Grey Fleet is the privately-owned cars belonging to employees that are driven by their owners whilst going about the business of their employer, with the costs reimbursed by the employer, normally on a pence per mile basis.

6.3 Delegates were attending the Workshop for a variety of reasons, including:

- Would it be practical to take an existing employer-provided car pool and turn it into a car club out of office hours?
- Would it be a good idea to cease operating an employer-provided car pool and transfer the work to a car club?
- At Darlington Council, work has started on a review of the Essential User / Casual User Car Allowance method of reimbursing staff travel expenses; a car pool will probably be required. Also, for information, see the work done under the Local Motion brand in Darlington, one of three Sustainable Travel Towns in England [for more details, visit: www.dothelocalmotion.co.uk].
- A Smarter Choices Smarter Places programme Sustainable Travel Town fleet manager was there information-gathering on behalf of colleagues.
- One local authority is offering staff a mix of in-house car pool, lease cars, car pool via a car club, and grey fleet; trying to understand how to improve the mix and reduce costs.

6.4 In the past, car pools for staff have generally earned themselves a poor reputation:

- Vehicle interiors are not kept clean
- Car keys cannot be located
- Repairs, maintenance, and defect reporting not handled efficiently
- Booking process is cumbersome, usually someone writing bookings in a hard-backed diary
- Financial and utilisation data is not made available
- Pool vehicles are not conveniently located
- Manual record-keeping in the car
- Inability to book ahead
- and so on...

Leading to people declaring “We tried a car pool and we gave up on it”.

6.5 A car club operator can now offer the possibility of dealing with many if not all of these issues:

- Internet booking
- Data on utilisation, by individual driver, without need for any paperwork by that driver
- Vehicle located close to the workplace
- System for timely cleaning, maintenance and defect remedial work
- Improved vehicle utilisation rates
- And generally a much more convenient service.

- 6.6 But what do we mean when we describe this form of transport provision as convenient? This is a subject of considerable interest to Transport Psychology. We started to try to define it: a staff car pool will be described as convenient if...
- It can be used for spontaneous journeys
 - [But: this could merely encourage poor planning of journeys? In practice, research has shown that car club members tend to book a car to undertake a series of journeys, to make more efficient use of their hire time]
 - It is easy to use
 - It offers shorter journey times [But: these may just be perceived to be shorter journey times; this view may be reinforced strongly if at the same time the car pool user also perceives other alternative modes for the journey likely to take longer; in practice, it has been shown many times that people do not factor in the true time taken into their estimates for journey times, i.e. the trip office desk to office desk may be “10 minutes by car”, to which has to be added 5 minutes to get to the car and drive off, and 10 minutes to park and walk to the destination, giving a total of 25 minutes – at which point 10 minutes becomes an underestimate of 150%.].
 - Parked nearby
 - I feel I am in control of my travel arrangements
- 6.7 There is a further complication. If a car pool is operated by a car club operator on behalf of a public sector organisation, there will be a premium paid to cover the costs of managing the fleet and providing the service. This additional cost has to be compared with the costs of running a car pool in-house or with relying on the grey fleet. In order to make a rational comparison, there needs to be a calculation of the time taken by the member of staff requiring a car to secure a booking and to get from their desk to the car, and a value needs to be placed on this time. Overall business effectiveness is rarely factored into decisions about current staff travel policies.
- 6.8 Staff travel expenses regimes were set in place many years ago, when circumstances were very different. They now look increasingly anachronistic when we take into account the need to reduce our organisations’ carbon footprints. For instance, the NHS terms and conditions system, Agenda For Change, has Annex L that covers staff travel expenses on NHS business. In July 2008, in the light of petrol and diesel fuel increases, the Standard rate for car users went up 10% to 58.3 pence per mile for cars with engines 1,500 cc or over; at the same time, the “public transport rate” rose from an unrealistic 23 ppm to 24 ppm. It seems unlikely the car mileage rate is now going to be reduced following the recent fuel price decreases. In other words, Annex L is now part of many NHS employees’ remuneration package.
- 6.9 Another reason for operating a car club car pool: one Edinburgh architecture firm sees it as a method of retaining staff.

7 WORKSHOP 4 - WILL A CAR CLUB WORK IN MY LOCALITY?

Contributors

Antonia Roberts, Co-Director, Carplus.

Chas Ball, independent consultant (founder of City Car Club)

- 7.1 Many issues discussed in this workshop are outlined in the Carplus “Fast Track Guide”
- 7.2 The discussion looked at two distinct approaches to car club operation – the commercial operator’s criteria on viability and suitability and the operating approach of the independent, largely not-for profit sector.
- 7.3 Commercial operators have concentrated in the “core cities” of England plus Edinburgh and the only smaller cities served are mainly historic cities near existing schemes and towns and cities with a strong corporate user (e.g. Maidstone). The business models of Whizz Go and City Car Club had recently been reviewed with the result that a number of towns and cities lost emergent cars clubs – examples include Winchester, St Albans, Belfast, Reading, Worcester and High Wycombe. In some cases non profit operators have taken over.
- 7.4 Commercial operators need cities with population and business density, parking pressures, good or excellent public transport and a supportive local authority partner willing to try and develop a car club run car pool for staff travel. The commercial operator needs to establish a viable operation within a short time span and although it is hard to be specific, Chas Ball suggested that a pool of 20-30 cars was required to establish an effective local presence to maintain the cars and market membership.
- 7.5 The transaction between car club and local authority over on-street parking is not easy to describe as it varies from operators paying several hundred pounds a year in favourable location in central London and local authorities providing on street bays entirely free of charge in areas where establishing a commercial car club is more problematic.
- 7.6 The workshop explored the opportunities to develop a car club with a significant contribution from members on a voluntary basis. Antonia Roberts explained there were a variety of models ranging from small voluntary neighbourhood schemes to a larger multi-site Community Interest Company, Commonwheels that is working towards a national network using sophisticated booking and on-board technology.

8 QUESTION TIME (15.30 – 16.20)

Panel

Chair: *Rob Edwards (RE): Environmental Journalist*

Michael Glotz-Richter (MGR), City of Bremen Council

Bernie Hanning (BM), Managing Director, OyBike Systems Ltd.

Dr Jillian Anable (JA), University of Aberdeen & UK Energy Research Centre

Prof Steve Stradling (SS), Professor of Transport Psychology, Transport Research Institute, Napier University; Chair of Transform Scotland Trust.

Antonia Roberts (AR), Co-director, Car Plus.

Note: Q = Question, A = Answer, C = Comment

- 8.1 **Q: Chas Ball** – How do the panel suggest ways in which we can get public transport operators to come to or even talk about this event?
- 8.2 **A: JA** – Public transport approaches are very bad at knowing the market. They are starting to take marketing more seriously. There is also a new focus on corporate responsibility but there is a disjuncture between top-level management and those on the ground. Top-level managers need to get more involved in marketing.
- 8.3 **A: SS** – Public transport operators are waking up to car clubs but the core of the matter is funding, i.e., they don't have enough.
- 8.4 **A: MGR** – Public transport operators are conservative in their thinking. Also, directors don't use their own product. Brussels directly involves car sharing in public transport operations. There is a public transport conference in Vienne in June, which incorporates car sharing. The role of the council needs to do more to bring the two together by using political pressure or even denying access to subsidies until car sharing and public transport can work together.
- 8.5 **A: BH** – public transport operators need to deliver journeys, not destinations.
- 8.6 **Q:** We consume transport trips as a resource like we consume energy. We can get combined gas and electric. Can we get combined bike-share, car-share etc.?
- 8.7 **A: JA** – BP rebranded themselves as an energy company rather than oil company. Re-branding of public transport could also happen. There will be a time when we will become much more energy alert. Carbon budgets will need to be tied up into the way we consume. Re-branding may be to tie these in together.
- 8.8 **C:** We cannot trade in sustainable development. We have major regulatory failure in transport at the moment. The carbon price internationally is far too low. Lets have a carbon trading scheme within Edinburgh?
- 8.9 **C: James Finlayson** – Oyster Cards have worked very well in London. Anyone who holds an Oyster Card can be signed up to car club as a member on the day. If Edinburgh had a similar system then it would help the car club.

- 8.10 **Q to MGR:** China has great opportunities for car clubs. Can you talk a little about this?
- 8.11 **A: MGR** – China has great density of people. This is not comparable with the UK or European cities. If one in ten people had a car, the city simply would not function. There is growth in car ownership and people realise that it can't go on. People realise they need an alternative understanding of mobility and urban space, which goes hand-in-hand with the understanding that oil is limited and the need to reduce CO² emissions. The UK is addressing a behavioural issue. This is the first step and needs to be advertised for other nations to see.
- 8.12 **Q to MGR:** I live in a small town with high commuting by rail. What is the scope for having a car club out post in a commuter town? In order to make car clubs viable, you need to have cars used in the day. Are there any solutions that may overcome this?
- 8.13 **A: MGR** – Neighbours can get together and put each other on their insurance and form a miniature car club. We have to work together to help fill this niche.
- 8.14 **A: James Finlayson** – No car club makes a profit yet. The business plan needs to be covered first of all. Once this is addressed, maybe in five years, suburban car clubs may be possible. There may be concerns however that there would be insufficient business use.
- 8.15 **C: Joachim Schwarz** – Small cities and towns around Bremen have tried this and they have all failed. One of the main reasons people car share is to avoid the hassle and cost of parking. Where there is lots of parking in cities, car clubs tend not to do so well. Suburban areas tend to have ample parking. For this reason, car clubs in suburban areas will struggle.
- 8.16 **A: JA** – in rural areas or small cities, you have situations where people are socially excluded. Conceivably, a car club could operate in these areas to meet social exclusion targets or relinquish the need for a second car.
- 8.17 **A: AR** – If people don't want to have to pay for a first or second car, the will to create a car club will be there and so it is possible. It is about working with communities to bring in their time and resources and think more creatively and cleverly. A car club doesn't always have to be as large and grand as a city car club.
- 8.18 **A: MGR** – We have to look internally at lifestyles, look at parking and paying, look at the tools we have to use on offer...